Development of Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education (CWIE) in Thailand and ASEAN

by

Professor Dr. Wichit Srisa-an
President of Thai Association for Cooperative Education (TACE)

February 6th - 7th, 2014
FOREWORDS

This booklet contains two academic articles based on the presentations that I was invited to make at the Japan Forum for Work-Integrated Learning (WIL) funded by Japan’s Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT) from February 6th to 7th, 2014 at Arcadia Ichigaya in Tokyo, Japan.

The two articles include:

1. Workshop on ‘Development of Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education in Thailand’ conducted on February 6th, 2014 from 1.30-3.30pm for a group of 12 participants including administrators and CWIE personnel from the four universities keenly interested in pioneering CWIE in Japan; namely, Kyoto Sangyo University, Niigata University, Seijo University, and Fukuoka Institute of Technology

2. Special lecture entitled ‘Current State and Challenges of Industry-University Cooperative Education in ASEAN Countries: What can Japan Learn as a Late Starter?’ delivered on February 7th, 2014 from 1.35-2.35pm to an audience of 200 participants consisting of Japanese government officials and university and workplace CWIE personnel.

I would like to express my heartfelt appreciation to the organising committee of the Japan Forum for Work-Integrated Learning (WIL) for their generous invitation. I would like also to thank all the participants of the workshop and lecture for the opportunity for me to share and learn from them as well. I thoroughly enjoyed the dialogues that we had which brought about interesting ideas for CWIE development in Japan. Finally, my thanks goes to Assistant Professor Dr Issra Pramoolsook from the School of Foreign Languages, Suranaree University of Technology, Thailand for his help with the final editing of these two articles.

I hope that the information in these two articles will be beneficial for the development of CWIE in Japan and the further enhancement of CWIE in Thailand.

[Signature]

Professor Dr Wichit Srisa-an
President
Thai Association for Cooperative Education
Workshop on Development of Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education in Thailand
By Professor Dr Wichit Srisa-an
President of Thai Association for Cooperative Education
At Japan Forum for Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education
February 6th, 2014, Tokyo, Japan

This presentation will share and discuss the development of Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education or CWIE in Thailand that spans the period of 21 years from 1993 to 2014. The development of the CWIE will be divided into 2 case studies; namely,

1. Institutional Case Study of Suranaree University of Technology (SUT), which is the birthplace of CWIE in Thailand in 1993
2. National Case Study of Thailand. The first government’s policy and support was given to CWIE in 2002.

To begin with Case 1: Institutional Case Study of Suranaree University of Technology (SUT), some background information about SUT is necessary. This university was established in 1990 to respond to Thailand’s shortage of human resource in science and technology with two key characteristics, which are

1. Provincial and regional public autonomous university, the first in Thailand, with a main core function of high quality graduate production
2. Specialised university with emphasis on science and technology i.e. natural sciences, industrial technology, environmental and resource technology, agricultural technology, and social technology.

As a new university in the countryside, it is necessary for SUT to provide education that has a competitive quality in the labour market. Quality of graduate is therefore the vital area.

Therefore, SUT decided to integrate CWIE in its undergraduate curriculum and implemented the CWIE programme in 1993, the first university in Thailand to do so, in order to:

1. Develop and improve the quality of its graduates
2. Respond to the new market demand
3. Engage with more community and industry, and
4. Prepare the graduates to be ready for work right after their graduation.

As for the design, standards, and structure of CWIE at SUT,

1. CWIE is designed to be an essential part of the academic professional programme.
2. The SUT CWIE requires the students to undertake sufficient work-based experience at senior level.
3. Also, the students have to work full-time for a period of at least 4 months at a work place with academic supervision and assessment, earning not less than 6 credits.
The SUT CWIE standards apply to both the university and workplaces. As for the university, the standards are reflected through the curriculum, academic advising, student, and evaluation whereas for the work places, the CWIE standards are guaranteed by the management of the programme, the academic activities, and the mentoring.

Regarding the implementation of the CWIE programme at SUT, the programme is implemented on the university-wide basis, fostering bilateral partnership between the university and work places. All the activities are coordinated by SUT’s Cooperative Education and Career Development Centre. From 1995-1998, SUT implemented CWIE as the pilot or elective project. Then, the assessment of the pilot project pointed out its success because the graduates had high employment rate, so the students requested for cooperative education to be compulsory. As a result, cooperative education has been a regular or compulsory programme for SUT students since 1999 until today.

In the meantime, CWIE at SUT has been expanded to the global scale as well. The Thai Association for Cooperative Education, or TACE, was established in 2001 to work closely with the World Association for Cooperative Education, or WACE. Also, SUT has been creating international CWIE partnerships with universities and workplaces outside Thailand.

Figure 1 shows the SUT’s statistics of CWIE pilot project between 1995 and 1998 in comparison with the regular programme from 1999 until the present.
The most important point which should be highlighted is the educational effect of the CWIE. The beneficial effects can be concluded as the WIN-WIN-WIN situation for the students, the university, and the work places.

First, for the benefits for the students, CWIE helps the students:
1. Gain professional experience related to specialization
2. Obtain higher GPA
3. Attain more self-confidence and self-development
4. Have stronger presentation and communication skills
5. Have a better chance to get a job offer before graduation
6. Have a better chance to choose appropriate career
7. Earn supplementary income, and
8. Reach higher potential to be well-qualified professionals.

As for the benefits for the university, they include:
1. Fostering good relationship and cooperation with work places
2. Receiving feedback on curriculum and teaching-learning improvement
3. Gaining recognition from work places and industries.

Finally, work places also benefit from CWIE. The benefits are:
1. There is a supplementary supply of workforce.
2. Full-time staff has more time to do more important job.
3. CWIE is an appropriate means of selecting and recruiting new staff.
4. Work places create additional collaboration with universities in other areas.
5. Joining the CWIE gives a positive image to the work places.

Therefore, to conclude this first part of the case study of SUT, the SUT CWIE assessment results based on 6 years of CWIE experience showed that:
1. CWIE received overwhelming approval from work places and industries.
2. CWIE students received excellent rating in their work and academic reports.
3. Workplace personnel and supervisors praised SUT students’ performance and behavior.
4. Students evaluated work experience to instill more professionalism and to help in self-development.
5. SUT earns the top rank in graduate employment.

The second half of this presentation is about the national case study of the development of CWIE in Thailand from 2002 to present. It started with the first government support of 350USD/Head to the universities, with the total budget of 3,000,000USD for the period of 2002-2004, using the SUT CWIE as the model.

In 2008, the Thai government by the Office of Higher Education Commission or OHEC made a 5-year strategic plan for supporting sustainable development of CWIE from 2008 to 2012. In this plan, OHEC set five key strategies for the expansion and consolidation of CWIE, which are:
1. Promoting more knowledge and better understanding of CWIE
2. Creating more CWIE standards
3. Strengthening promotion and support of CWIE
4. Increasing international CWIE
5. Enhancing CWIE monitoring and assessment.
Figure 3 shows the growth of CWIE from the pilot period of 2002-2004 to the 5-year strategic plan 2008-2012.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PLANS</th>
<th>NO. OF UNIV.</th>
<th>NO. OF WORK PLACES</th>
<th>NO. OF STUDENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. PILOT 2002-2004</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>10,444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. STRATEGIC 2008-2012</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>12,962</td>
<td>26,048</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Then, just last year OHEC again made the 3-year strategic plan from 2013-2015 to further support the CWIE operations. This plan emphasises:

1. CWIE Quality and quality assurance
2. Readiness and strengths of university CWIE Networks.
   - There are NINE regional networks altogether nationwide
3. International CWIE and ASEAN CWIE Network
4. CWIE monitoring and assessment.

To carry out all these tasks, the main organization responsible for the CWIE development in Thailand is the Thai Association for Cooperative Education, or TACE.

It was established in 2001 to support the organising of WACE World Conference at SUT. It has the leadership role in CWIE development in Thailand and it has a close partnership with WACE with strong involvement in the governance and in programmes and activities, leading to the establishment of WACE International Satellite Office at SUT or WACE ISO@SUT to serve ASEAN and Asia.

Another key partner of TACE is the Office of Higher Education Commission or OHEC, and they work closely together to promote and support CWIE policies and plans. Key activities of TACE include:

1. Trainings for university and work place CWIE personnel
2. Development of CWIE standards and quality assurance
3. Publication of CWIE Journals
4. CWIE research and assessment
5. Consultancy services to universities, work places, and OHEC.
Figure 4 shows the TACE’s statistics of training programmes for university and work place personnel, which started in 2008 until today.

![Figure 4: TACE’S STATISTICS OF TRAINING PROGRAMS FOR UNIVERSITY AND WORK PLACE PERSONNEL 2008-2014](image)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>TRAINING PROGRAMMES</th>
<th>NO. OF TRAINEES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2008 TO PRESENT</td>
<td>BASIC CWIE</td>
<td>2980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>TRAINING OF THE TRAINERS</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>INTERNATIONAL CWIE</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td></td>
<td>3116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Finally, this presentation would like to point out the prospects and challenges of CWIE that lie ahead.

First, for the past 20 years, universities and work places have expanded CWIE to the point that 75% of all the universities in Thailand offer CWIE.

The next stage is the consolidation of CWIE as set by TACE and OHEC for:

1. Development of CWIE quality
2. Implementation of CWIE standards
3. CWIE quality assurance.

Also, in this consolidation stage, it is time for universities and the CWIE Regional Networks to strengthen themselves for self-reliance and sustainable development.

Secondly, the CWIE strength and development from the consolidation stage will be beneficial for the continual and sustainable enhancement of the students, the universities, the work places, and the Thai society as a whole.

Lastly, to respond to the needs in the globalization era, CWIE has been acknowledged as an effective practice to enable Thai students to have international perspectives and qualities by placing them for CWIE in partner work places in their target country in ASEAN and around the world.

******************************************************************************

Finally, this presentation would like to point out the prospects and challenges of CWIE that lie ahead.

First, for the past 20 years, universities and work places have expanded CWIE to the point that 75% of all the universities in Thailand offer CWIE.

The next stage is the consolidation of CWIE as set by TACE and OHEC for:

1. Development of CWIE quality
2. Implementation of CWIE standards
3. CWIE quality assurance.

Also, in this consolidation stage, it is time for universities and the CWIE Regional Networks to strengthen themselves for self-reliance and sustainable development.

Secondly, the CWIE strength and development from the consolidation stage will be beneficial for the continual and sustainable enhancement of the students, the universities, the work places, and the Thai society as a whole.

Lastly, to respond to the needs in the globalization era, CWIE has been acknowledged as an effective practice to enable Thai students to have international perspectives and qualities by placing them for CWIE in partner work places in their target country in ASEAN and around the world.

******************************************************************************
Question and Answer Session

1. What is the role of academic advisors?

The academic advisors prepare the 30-hour preparatory course for the students, visit the work site, talk with mentors, and solve the problems if there is any. They also monitor the progress of the students and evaluate their experience when finished.

2. Do you have CWIE coordinators?

Most of the Thai universities offering CWIE normally designate the roles of academic advisors and CWIE coordinators to their faculty members with the support from the full-time staff members for administrative issues and coordination with work places.

3. Was the transition from the pilot project to the regular programme because SUT students requested it?

SUT offered CWIE to its students as an elective component in the curriculum for 4 years during the pilot project. Then, the evaluation results of the project indicating satisfaction from all parties concerned i.e. the students, faculty members, university, and work places, led to the agreement between the students and faculty members to incorporate CWIE as the regular programme in the undergraduate curriculum.

4. How does CWIE contribute to employers’ recruitment?

They say it helps for recruitment and selection. Judging only from résumé and interview can lead to a wrong selection. CWIE, on the other hand, allows the work place to get to know the students and to evaluate their work performance after a period of 4 months. This familiarity with the students enables the work place to select the most suitable employees who can start working right away without the work place organising pre-employment training for them.

5. How do you assess the quality of mentors, work places, and academic advisors?

CWIE quality assurance is a critical issue, so TACE and OHEC worked closely together to set the CWIE standards for the students, faculty members, work places, and mentors. Besides, the monitoring of student performance is also set as a minimum standard that all parties use for their CWIE provision. The CWIE performance must be assessed using the same criteria as other academic courses. Students who participate in CWIE must have better academic records than average, must complete the preparatory course before their placement, and must be evaluated by both the mentor and the academic advisor. Faculty members need to have experience of teaching more than one trimester. As for the work place, commitment from the management and assignment of suitable mentors are the basic requirement. Mentors need to be university graduates and have more than 3 years of work experience.
6. What is the percentage of 103 universities which have CWIE programme among the total number of universities in Thailand?

There are 139 universities in Thailand, both public and private, so 75% of the entire number of universities have CWIE programme.

7. The biggest hurdle in Japan is to change the awareness of the faculty. How about in Thailand?

In Thailand, we had the same problem, probably even more difficult. Raising the awareness in the faculty members and creating a correct understanding for their acceptance are crucial. In Thailand, it took 10 years to achieve that by starting the pilot project in a university and then expanding it to the national level by receiving support from the government. Nevertheless, promotion of knowledge about and correct understanding of CWIE has to be done on a continuous basis with all parties concerned through a series of trainings for faculty members and CWIE personnel from universities, work places, and related organisations. These trainings have been offered by TACE for about 10 years and more is on the way to keep these people updated with the changes in CWIE.

8. What is the average payment to CWIE students in Thailand?

CWIE students are paid more than the minimum wage which is 10USD or 300 baht a day. The payment is called a compensation not a salary. Employers of CWIE students are entitled to 200% tax reduction from the total expenses on CWIE students.

Special Lecture
“Current State and Challenges of Industry-University Cooperative Education in ASEAN Countries: What can Japan learn as a late starter?”

by Professor Dr Wichit Srisa-an
President of Thai Association for Cooperative Education
At Japan Forum for Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education

February 7th, 2014, Tokyo, Japan

This special lecture is divided into four sections, including
1) Current State of Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education (CWIE) in Thailand
2) Transition of CWIE in ASEAN
3) Challenges
4) What can Japan learn from Thailand’s Cooperative Work-Integrated Education.

Firstly, the case of CWIE in Thailand will be elaborated, highlighting the current state of CWIE in the country. Thailand has been doing CWIE for more than 20 years. It started at Suranaree University of Technology (SUT) in 1993 as a key strategy to improve the quality of the graduates to be in line with Thailand’s Qualifications Frameworks and the Professional Standards and also to meet the demand of the new labour market that requires graduates
to have firm theoretical knowledge, practical skills, and readiness for employment right after their graduation.

At the very beginning, SUT implemented the CWIE programme as a four-year pilot project from 1995-1998. Back then, it was an 8-credit non-compulsory programme for 3rd year students with majors who were entering their 4th year. These students were required to work in a work place as full-time employees on assigned jobs or projects related to their major for a minimum period of 4 months. They also received training and supervision from both work place mentors and from SUT academic supervisors.

The evaluation result of the pilot CWIE programme from around 500 participating CWIE students found that the university, work places, and students were very much satisfied with the quality of SUT graduates. It also showed that SUT graduates had a high employment rate and they were ready to work right after their graduation without training before job. In essence, the overall result confirmed and emphasized the significance of CWIE for graduates’ employability and career development. Therefore, since 1999 SUT has integrated CWIE as a compulsory component of all of its undergraduate curricula.

The success of the CWIE at SUT was evident to the then Ministry of University Affairs, so in 2002 the MUA made a proposal to the government to support CWIE in both public and private universities in Thailand by asking them to follow “The SUT CWIE MODEL”. Since then, 103 universities out of 139 nationwide have been organising CWIE for their students.

Later, the Office of Higher Education Commission (OHEC, formerly The Ministry of University Affairs) requested SUT and the Thai Association for Cooperative Education (TACE) to be in charge of key strategic activities for CWIE enhancement, including:

1. to provide trainings for CWIE personnel in Thailand
2. to set the CWIE standards
3. to produce the Thai Journal of Cooperative Education, and
4. to organise the annual National Cooperative Education Day (June, 6th)

All of these activities have been ongoing until today.

The following Figures 1-4 provide illustrative outcome of SUT, OHEC and TACE statistics of CWIE from 1995-2013.
It has been confirmed and well recognised that the CWIE experience of the Thai universities during the past 20 years has 1) strengthened the universities and work places and 2) equipped them with mutual capacity to jointly produce high-quality graduates. Besides, CWIE has fostered strong and sustainable University-Industry cooperation for quality workforce production to meet the professional standards and respond to the needs of the new labour market.

CWIE is thus considered as an effective option for quality workforce production in the fast-changing and highly competitive world of the 21st century.
TRANSITION OF CWIE IN ASEAN

Thailand, as one of the ten nations in ASEAN, needs to be responsive, proactive, and adaptive to the changes that come with the integration of the ASEAN Community in 2015. One of the three pillars of ASEAN is the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC), which allows and promotes free trade and mobility and free flow of labour and knowledge workers across the member countries. Universities, therefore, must ensure that their graduates have professional content knowledge, practical skills, languages for communication i.e. English and local languages cross cultural work capacity, and ASEAN socio-cultural identities and awareness.

Thus, International CWIE is an effective means for quality development of Thai graduates by enriching their work-based learning in a foreign country before graduation. It is fortunate that Thailand’s Office of Higher Education Commission (OHEC) has set a timely policy to promote International CWIE in Thai universities from 2013 to 2015 to provide preparations and support for students interested in doing CWIE in ASEAN countries.

Such promotional activities include:

1. Scholarships for Thai students to undertake international CWIE in ASEAN countries, 30 scholarships in total, with 800USD each. But for Singapore, students will get 1,600 USD.
2. Funding for TACE to organise the International Conference on International Cooperative and Work-Integrated Education: Expanding Sustainable Networking (ICCW 2011) in Bangkok


The survey finding points out that some ASEAN countries such as Indonesia, Malaysia, Singapore, The Philippines, and Thailand have already been carrying out domestic and international CWIE. Therefore, with the support from these governments and the ASEAN mechanism, International CWIE will be promoted and expanded further.

In the OHEC’s CWIE Strategic Plans (2013-2015), there will be the establishment of the ASEAN CWIE Network. For this establishment, OHEC has requested TACE and WACE International Satellite Office at Suranaree University of Technology (WACE ISO@SUT) to coordinate with potential partner universities in ASEAN to establish the ASEAN CWIE network before the year 2015. Preparations for the establishment are currently being undertaken.

Before the ASEAN CWIE Network establishment, many universities in ASEAN and ASEAN Plus countries such as Australia, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Singapore, and Thailand already have an agreement on International CWIE student exchange. Such university initiatives will be strengthened and upgraded to a grander scale once the ASEAN CWIE Network is established.
CHALLENGES

The world community in the globalisation era is marked with the fast changes, greater competition, and the unprecedented scale of skilled and knowledge workers mobilisation. The main challenges for universities, industries, and business organisations are the preparation of the 21st century workforce to have the desired quality and qualifications for the labour market in the globalised world.

CWIE is an effective means to meet those challenges along with other channels for knowledge workforce development.

WHAT CAN JAPAN LEARN AS A LATE STARTER?

LESSON 1

To embark on some innovative ideas in education, one must make sure that such ideas can really serve the purposes to solve the existing problems and yield improvements. Thai universities faced with the problem of low-quality graduates and ineffective graduation production, resulting in the gap between theory and practice, poor English proficiency, and low readiness for employment. The burden is on the work places who have to train these graduates for 6 months or more before they can know the work and know how to work. Therefore, Thailand decided to promote CWIE to empower the students before they graduate by not ADOPTING but ADAPTING the existing systems from elsewhere to suit the Thai education context.

LESSON 2

From the 20-year experience of offering CWIE, it has confirmed that the students must be enriched with work-based experience for an appropriate period of time such as a minimum of 4 months. This is because to get to know the work and to know how to work require a substantial period of time, which is markedly different from the traditional short study visit or work observation.

A suitable period of time, it has been found, is not less than 4 months. In some countries, the CWIE is for 8 months or for a year.

LESSON 3

The effectiveness of CWIE placement depends on the pre-CWIE student preparations. The students must be ready for job application and doing the work with other workers. For International CWIE, the students need even more preparations in terms of the language, cross-cultural communication, and self-adjustment to a new work culture and work environment.

LESSON 4

CWIE shares a similar nature to that of internship. Thus, close mentoring and guidance from the work place and academic supervisors are another key to success, which can be given to the students along with the monitoring and assessment activities.
LESSON 5

Another key success factor of CWIE is the mutual responsibility between the universities and the work places to support the CWIE students by treating them as temporary full-time employees in their organisations so that they receive valuable work-based experience in accordance with the CWIE standards.

In conclusion, the five lessons above are the key success factors for anybody who would like to implement CWIE. They also need to develop the CWIE system that is the most responsive to the problems and needs and the most appropriate and effective for the context of each country.

Undoubtedly, it is not too late for Japan to develop the most appropriate and effective CWIE system for your own country. A good beginning will ensure that you will have a perfect ending.

I trust without any reservation that with the strong determination from everyone here Japan will be successful and exceptional in this CWIE mission.

REFERENCES


